



*Studies in Writing & Rhetoric*

## Other Books in the Studies in Writing & Rhetoric Series

*Rhetoric and Reality: Writing Instruction in American Colleges, 1900–1985*

James A. Berlin

*Writing Instruction in Nineteenth-Century American Colleges*

James A. Berlin

*Something Old, Something New: College Writing Teachers and Classroom Change*

Wendy Bishop

*Variables of Composition: Process and Product in a Business Setting*

Glenn J. Broadhead and  
Richard C. Freed

*Audience Expectations and Teacher Demands*

Robert Brooke and John Hendricks

*Dialogue, Dialectic, and Conversation: A Social Perspective on the Function of Writing*

Gregory Clark

*Toward a Grammar of Passages*

Richard M. Coe

*Writing Groups: History, Theory, and Implications*

Anne Ruggles Gere

*Computers and Composing*

Jeanne W. Halpern and Sarah Liggett

*Teaching Writing as a Second Language*

Alice S. Horning

*Women Writing in the Academy: Audience, Authority, and Transformation*

Gesa E. Kirsch

*Invention as a Social Act*

Karen Burke LeFevre

*New Perspective on Cohesion in Expository Paragraphs*

Robin Bell Markels

*Gender Influences: Reading Student Texts*

DonnaLee Rubin

*The Young Composers: Composition's Beginnings in Nineteenth-Century Schools*

Lucille M. Schultz

*Technology and Literacy in the Twenty-First Century: The Importance of Paying Attention*

Cynthia L. Selfe

*Across Property Lines: Textual Ownership in Writing Groups*

Candace Spigelman

*Mutuality in the Rhetoric and Composition Classroom*

David L. Wallace and Helen

Rothschild Ewald

*Evaluating College*

*Writing Programs*

Stephen P. Witte and Lester Faigley

## *Rehearsing New Roles*



# Rehearsing New Roles

How College Students  
Develop as Writers

---

Lee Ann Carroll

SOUTHERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY PRESS  
*Carbondale and Edwardsville*

Copyright © 2002 by The Conference on College Composition and  
Communication of the National Council of Teachers of English

All rights reserved

Printed in the United States of America

05 4 3

Publication partially funded by a subvention grant from The Conference on  
College Composition and Communication of the National Council of Teachers of  
English.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Carroll, Lee Ann, 1946–

Rehearsing new roles : how college students develop as writers / Lee Ann  
Carroll.

p. cm. — (Studies in writing & rhetoric)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. English language—Rhetoric—Study and teaching. 2. Report  
writing—Study and teaching (Higher). I. Title. II. Series.

PE1404 .C346 2002

808'.042'0711—dc21

ISBN 0–8093–2449–0 (pbk. : alk. paper)

2002018755

Printed on recycled paper. ♻️

The paper used in this publication meets the minimum requirements of American  
National Standard for Information Sciences—Permanence of Paper for Printed  
Library Materials, ANSI Z39.48–1992. ♻️

*To my father, John Carroll, with thanks, and in  
memory of my mother, Elva Vollmer Carroll*





# Contents

Preface	xi
Acknowledgments	xvii
1. A Preview of Writing Development	1
Writing Ability and Literacy Tasks	2
Examining Writing and Literacy	
Across Academic Disciplines	5
Profiles of Writing Development	8
A Cultural/Environmental View of Development	22
Challenging Faculty Fantasies About Writing	26
An Admonition, a Dispensation, and a Challenge	27
2. Studying College Writers: Context and Methods	29
Writing and Literacy in a Cultural Context	30
A Qualitative Methodology for Studying Development	42
3. Riding the Literacy Roller Coaster in General Education and First-Year Composition	47
Auditing Writing in Years One and Two	50
Writing That Works in General Education	55
Don't They Learn That in English?	61
Conflict and Resistance: Altering "Normal"	
Ways of Writing	65
What Composition Can/Not Teach	72
Writing Development in a Great Books Program	80
Teaching the Real Basics	85
4. Supporting Writing Development Across Disciplines	89
Direct Teaching of Writing, Research, and	
Ways of Knowing	92
Responding to Student Writers: Comments and Grades	95
Responding to Student Writers: Correcting Errors,	
Revising Style	98
Response from Peers	102

Learning Through Experience	104
Constraints on Writing	108
Student Writing Strategies	113
Performing New Roles	115
<b>5. A Concluding Look at Development</b>	<b>118</b>
The Role of First-Year Writing Courses	119
Adding an Upper-Level Writing Requirement	124
Assessing Writing Proficiency and Development	125
Recommendations for Instruction	129
Thinking Longitudinally	141
Appendix A	149
Appendix B	155
References	157
Index	161