Reference Guides to Rhetoric and Composition

Series Editor, Charles Bazerman

REFERENCE GUIDES TO RHETORIC AND COMPOSITION Series Editor, Charles Bazerman

The Series provides compact, comprehensive and convenient surveys of what has been learned through research and practice as composition has emerged as an academic discipline over the last half century. Each volume is devoted to a single topic that has been of interest in rhetoric and composition in recent years, to synthesize and make available the sum and parts of what has been learned on that topic. These reference guides are designed to help deepen classroom practice by making available the collective wisdom of the field and will provide the basis for new research. The Series is intended to be of use to teachers at all levels of education, researchers and scholars of writing, graduate students learning about the field, and all who have interest in or responsibility for writing programs and the teaching of writing.

Parlor Press and The WAC Clearinghouse are collaborating so that these books will be widely available through low-cost print editions and free digital distribution. The publishers and the Series editor are teachers and researchers of writing, committed to the principle that knowledge should freely circulate. We see the opportunities that new technologies have for further democratizing knowledge. And we see that to share the power of writing is to share the means for all to articulate their needs, interest, and learning into the great experiment of literacy.

Existing Books in the Series

Invention in Rhetoric and Composition (2004, Lauer)
Reference Guide to Writing across the Curriculum (2005, Bazerman,
Little, Bethel, Chavkin, Fouquette, and Garufis)
Revision: History, Theory, and Practice (2006, Horning and Becker)
Writing Program Administration (2007, McLeod)
Community Literacy and the Rhetoric of Local Publics (2008, Long)
Argument in Composition (2009, Ramage, Callaway, Clary-Lemon, and Waggoner)

Argument in Composition

John Ramage, Micheal Callaway, Jennifer Clary-Lemon, and Zachary Waggoner

Parlor Press West Lafayette, Indiana www.parlorpress.com

The WAC Clearinghouse http://wac.colostate.edu/

Parlor Press LLC, West Lafayette, Indiana 47906

© 2009 by Parlor Press and The WAC Clearinghouse All rights reserved.

John Leo's "Turning a Blind Eye to Evil," 12 October 2001, *U.S. News and World Report*. © 2001, U.S. News and World Report, L.P. Reprinted with permission.

Stanley Fish's "Condemnation without Absolutes," 15 October 2001, The New York Times. © 2001, The New York Times Company. Reprinted with permission.

Printed in the United States of America

SAN: 254-8879

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Argument in composition / John Ramage ... [et al.].

p. cm. -- (Reference guides to rhetoric and composition)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-60235-109-7 (pbk. : alk. paper) -- ISBN 978-1-60235-110-3 (hard-cover : alk. paper) -- ISBN 978-1-60235-111-0 (adobe ebook)

1. English language--Rhetoric--Study and teaching (Higher) 2. Persuasion (Rhetoric)--Study and teaching (Higher) 3. Report writing--Study and teaching (Higher) I. Ramage, John D.

PE1431.A77 2009 808'.0420711--dc22

2009032671

Series logo designed by Karl Stolley. Copyediting by Ethan Sproat. This book is printed on acid-free paper.

Parlor Press, LLC is an independent publisher of scholarly and trade titles in print and multimedia formats. This book is available in paperback, cloth, and Adobe eBook formats from Parlor Press on the World Wide Web at http://www.parlorpress.com. For submission information or to find out about Parlor Press publications, write to Parlor Press, 816 Robinson St., West Lafayette, Indiana, 47906, or e-mail editor@parlorpress.com.

The WAC Clearinghouse supports teachers of writing across the disciplines. Hosted by Colorado State University's Composition Program, it brings together four journals, three book series, and resources for teachers who use writing in their courses. This book will also be available free on the Internet at The WAC Clearinghouse (http://wac.colostate.edu/).

Contents

Reference Guides to Rhetoric and Composition i
Series Editor's Preface ix Preface xi
1 Introduction: Why Argument Matters 3 Coming to an Understanding of Argument 5 John Leo, "Cultural Relativism Leaves Some Blind to Evil" (2001, Universal Press Syndicate), 10/15/01 7 Stanley Fish, "Condemnation without Absolutes" 9 Discussion of Leo and Fish Part I: Some Theoretical Background 11 Discussion of Leo and Fish Part II: Getting from Duality to Commitment 15 Leo and Fish Part III: The Elements of Argument Argument and "the purification of war" 25 Why students Need Argument 30 Argument and Critical Literacy 31 Argument and Identity 35 Ethics and Argument 40
Notes 48 2 The History of Argument 49 Philosophy vs Rhetoric 50 Rhetoric's Ossification Problem 62 Key Figures of Modern Argument Theory 67 Introduction to Kenneth Burke 67 Introduction to Chaim Perelman and Lucie Olbrechts-Tyteca 73 Stephen Toulmin 86 Summary 94 Notes 97

vi Contents

3 Issues in Argument 98
The Fallacy Debate 98
The Pragma-Dialectical Approach to Fallacies 103
Alternatives to Focusing on Argument in a Writing
Class: Critical/Cultural Studies 106
Expressivist Pedagogy 109
Procedural Rhetoric 118
To Teach or Not to Teach Propaganda 122
What Is Propaganda? Burke and Ellul 123
Propaganda in a Nutshell 136
Notes 139
4 Introduction to Best Practices 140
What Works in Teaching Writing 140
Best Practices 143
Liberatory Rhetoric 146
Works Cited 151
For Further Reading 152
Argument Textbooks 152
Scholarly Works 152
Feminism and Argument 157
Works Cited 161
For Further Reading 162
Argument Textbooks 162
Scholarly Works 163
Service Learning and Argument 166
Works Cited 169
For Further Reading 170
Argument Textbooks 170
Scholarly Works 170
Writing Across the Curriculum (WAC) and
Writing in the Disciplines (WID) 174
Works Cited 177
For Further Reading 177
Argument Textbooks 177
Scholarly Works—General 178 Anthropology 178
Anthropology 178 Business 179
Economics 181
Engineering 182
Political Science 182

Contents vii

Computers and Writing	183
Works Cited 186	
For Further Reading 188	
Textbooks 188	
Scholarly Works 189	
Visual Rhetoric 191	
Works Cited 195	
For Further Reading 196	
Textbooks 196	
Scholarly Works 197	
5 Glossary of Terms 199	
6 Annotated Bibliography 213	
Works Cited 247	
Index 251	
About the Authors 257	