
Alternatives to Grading Student Writing

NCTE Editorial Board: Pat Cordeiro, Colette Daiute, Bobbi Fisher, Brenda Greene, Richard Luckert, Bill McBride, Alleen Pace Nilsen, Jerrie Cobb Scott, Karen Smith, Chair, ex officio, Michael Greer, ex officio

NCTE Committee on Alternatives to Grading Student Writing

Robert Baroz, Ripton, Vermont

Nick Carbone, University of Massachusetts at Amherst

Mary Beth Cody, University of Nevada, Reno

Marilyn Cooper, Michigan Technological University, Houghton

Alice Cross, Horace Greeley High School, Chappaqua, New York

Dallas Davies, Fremont High School, Sunnyvale, California

Carol Dietrich, DeVry Institute of Technology, Columbus, Ohio

Pamela Childers, The McCallie School, Chattanooga, Tennessee

Elizabeth Hodges, Virginia Commonwealth University, Richmond

Gwendolyn Jones, Tuskegee Institute, Alabama

Jean Ketter, Grinnell College, Iowa

Immaculate Kizza, University of Tennessee, Chattanooga

Terri LeClercq, University of Texas Law School, Austin

Marie Wilson Nelson, National Louis University, Tampa, Florida

Lynda Radican (Associate Chair), California State University–Sacramento

Joe Strzepek, University of Virginia, Charlottesville

Stephen Tchudi (Chair), University of Nevada, Reno

Alternatives to Grading Student Writing

Edited by

Stephen Tchudi

University of Nevada, Reno

NCTE Committee on Alternatives to Grading Student Writing

Manuscript Editor: Robert A. Heister/Humanities & Sciences Associates

Production Editor: Jamie Hutchinson

Interior Design: Doug Burnett

Cover Design: Loren Kirkwood

NCTE Stock Number: 01305-3050

©1997 by the National Council of Teachers of English. All rights reserved.
Printed in the United States of America.

It is the policy of NCTE in its journals and other publications to provide a forum for the open discussion of ideas concerning the content and the teaching of English and the language arts. Publicity accorded to any particular point of view does not imply endorsement by the Executive Committee, the Board of Directors, or the membership at large, except in announcements of policy, where such endorsement is clearly specified.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Alternatives to grading student writing / edited by Stephen Tchudi :

NCTE Committee on Alternatives to Grading Student Writing.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0-8141-0130-5

1. English language—Composition and exercises—Ability testing—United States. 2. English language—Composition and exercises—Study and teaching—United States—Evaluation. I. Tchudi, Stephen, 1942- . II. NCTE Committee on Alternatives to Grading Student Writing.

LB1576.A6157 1997

808'.042'071—dc21

97-10157
CIP

Contents

<i>Introduction: Degrees of Freedom in Assessment, Evaluation, and Grading</i> Stephen Tchudi	ix
I. Background and Theory	
1. It's Broken—Fix It! Liesel K. O'Hagan	3
2. Growth-Biased Assessing of Writers— A More Democratic Choice Marie Wilson Nelson	15
II. Responding to Student Writing	
3. Writing Students Need Coaches, Not Judges Lynn Holaday	35
4. Response: A Promising Beginning for Learning to Grade Student Writing Carol Beeghly Bencich	47
5. Can You Be Black and Write and Right? Elaine B. Richardson	63
6. Alternative Assessment of Second-Language Writing: A Developmental Model Janis Massa	77
7. Scribliolink: Inviting Parents to Respond to Their Children's Writing Joyce C. Fine	91
III. Classroom Strategies and Alternatives to Grading Student Writing	
8. Student Attitudes toward Grades and Evaluation on Writing Jean S. Ketter and Judith W. Hunter	103
9. Writing at Reading: How a Junior Year in England Changes Student Writers Mary B. Guthrow	122

10. Assessment through Collaborative Critique Sarah Robbins, Sue Poper, and Jennifer Herrod	137
11. What Grades Do for Us, and How to Do without Them Marcy Bauman	162
12. Seeing How Good <i>We</i> Can Get It Kelly Chandler and Amy Muentener	180
13. Grading on Merit and Achievement: Where Quality Meets Quantity Stephen Adkison and Stephen Tchudi	192
14. Total Quality: A Farewell to Grades Charles McDonnell	210
15. Using a Multidimensional Scoring Guide: A Win-Win Situation Gail M. Young	225
16. Students Using Evaluation in Their Writing Process Jacob S. Blumner and Francis Fritz	233
17. Unlocking Outcome-Based Education through the Writing Process Rick Pribyl	244
18. Portfolio Assessment as an Alternative to Grading Student Writing Kathleen Jones	255
19. Issues to Consider when Scoring Student Portfolios Anne Wescott Dodd	265
IV. Faculty Workshops in Alternatives to Grading Student Writing	
Developing Intrinsic Motivation for Students' Writing Immaculate Kizza	277
Weighing and Choosing Alternatives Stephen Tchudi	281
Contract Grades: An Agreement between Students and Their Teachers Lynda S. Radican	285
Using Rubrics and Holistic Scoring of Writing Jean S. Ketter	291

Alternative Assessment Methods across the Disciplines Pamela B. Childers	296
Communicating with Parents and the Public Marilyn M. Cooper	301
<i>Editor</i>	307